



**An Assessment of  
Low Pressure Crude Oil Pipelines  
and  
Crude Oil Gathering Lines  
in California**

**April 1997**

Pete Wilson, Governor  
Douglas Wheeler, Secretary, Resources Agency  
Richard Wilson, Director, Department of Forestry and Fire Protection  
Ronny J. Coleman, California State Fire Marshal  
Nancy Wolfe, Division Chief, Pipeline Safety and Enforcement

## Notice

This study was funded by the United States Department of Energy, Bartlesville Project. Development of this report was primarily completed by EDM Services, Inc., under contract to BDM/Oklahoma. Data utilized was furnished by the pipeline operators. EDM Services, Inc., BDM/Oklahoma, United States Department of Energy, and/or the California State Fire Marshal, and their staffs do not:

- M** warrant the accuracy or completeness of the data collected, nor
- M** assume any liability resulting from the use of, or damage resulting from any information presented herein.

The California State Fire Marshal, United States Department of Energy, EDM Services, Inc., and/or BDM/Oklahoma do not endorse products or manufacturers. Trade or manufacturers' names appear herein solely because they are considered essential to the objectives of this study.

Any questions concerning this study and requests for additional copies of this report may be directed to:

CDF/State Fire Marshal  
Pipeline Safety and Enforcement  
P. O. Box 944246  
Sacramento, CA 94244-2460

# California State Fire Marshal

## An Assessment of California

### Low-Pressure Crude Oil Pipelines and

### Crude Oil Gathering Lines

	PAGE
Executive Summary .....	1
Chapter 1: Introduction.....	8
1.1 Regulatory Authority .....	10
1.2 Relative Safety Perspective.....	11
Chapter 2: Methodology.....	14
2.1 Funding and Contracting.....	14
2.2 Steering Committee .....	14
2.3 Identify Study Participants and Pipelines .....	15
2.4 Data Gathering.....	17
2.5 Database Development.....	17
2.6 Field Audits .....	18
2.7 Barriers and Incentive Options .....	18
2.8 Potential Data Inconsistencies.....	19
Chapter 3: Background Pipeline Risk Data.....	22
3.1 CONCAWE - 1981 Through 1994 .....	23
3.2 U.S. Natural Gas Transmission and Gathering Lines (1/70-6/84) .....	25
3.3 U.S. Natural Gas Transmission and Gathering Lines (6/84-12/92).....	27
3.4 U.S. Hazardous Liquid Pipeline Accidents (1986-92).....	29
3.5 Data Summary of Regulated California Hazardous Liquid Pipelines (1981-90) .....	31
3.6 Data Summary of California Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study (1993-95) .....	36
3.7 Comparison of Various Incident Data Sources.....	37
3.8 Uncorrected Pipeline Risks .....	39
Chapter 4: General Risk Levels .....	40
4.1 Overall Incident Causes .....	43
4.2 Incident Rates By Study Year .....	45
4.3 Decade of Construction Effects.....	48
4.4 Operating Temperature Effects.....	53
4.5 Pipe Diameter Effects.....	57
4.6 Leak Detection Systems.....	60
4.7 Cathodic Protection System .....	63
4.8 Pipe Specification Effects .....	69
4.9 Pipe Type Effects .....	73
4.10 Operating Pressure Effects.....	77
4.11 External Pipe Coatings .....	81
4.12 Internal Inspections .....	87
4.13 Seasonal Effects .....	91
4.14 Pipeline Components .....	94
4.15 Hydrostatic Testing Interval .....	97
4.16 Spill Size Distribution.....	103

Table of Contents (continued)

4.17	Damage Distribution.....	109
4.18	Incident Rates by Internal Coating or Lining.....	113
4.19	Incident Rates by Above versus Below Grade Pipe.....	114
4.20	Recovery of Spilled Volumes.....	115
4.21	Injuries and Fatalities.....	116
Chapter 5: Barriers and Incentive Options.....		118
5.1	Responses from Regulatory Agencies-Incentives.....	119
5.2	Responses from Pipeline Operators-Incentives.....	121
5.3	Incentive Implementation.....	121
5.4	Summary of Questionnaire Results: Barriers.....	122
5.5	Actual and Potential Consequences of Barriers.....	123
5.6	Removing Barriers.....	124
5.7	Case Studies.....	125
Chapter 6: Conclusions.....		130
6.1	Database and Study Findings.....	130
6.2	Incentive Option Investigation Findings.....	132
Chapter 7: Recommendations.....		136
7.1	Database and Study.....	136
7.2	Barriers and Incentive Options.....	137
Chapter 8: Bibliography.....		139

**Tables**

1-1	Fatalities by Mode of Transportation.....	11
1-2	Estimated Fatalities Associated with Revenue Freight by Mode of Transportation.....	13
1-3	Estimated 1988 Fatalities per Billion Ton-Miles Transported by Mode of Transportation.....	13
2-1	Pipeline Assessment Steering Committee Members.....	21
3-1	European Hazardous Liquid Pipeline Incidents.....	24
3-2	U. S. Natural Gas Transmission and Gathering Lines (1/70-6/84).....	26
3-3	Onshore U. S. Natural Gas Transmission and Gathering Lines (6/84-12/92).....	28
3-4	U. S. Hazardous Liquid Pipeline Accidents (1986-92).....	30
3-5A	CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipeline Data - All Leaks (1981-90).....	32
3-5B	CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipeline Data - Leaks Greater than 5 bbl or \$5000 (1981-90).....	33
3-5C	CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipeline Data - Leaks Greater than \$50,000 (1981-90).....	34
3-5D	CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipeline Data - Leaks Greater than \$500,000 (1981-90).....	35

Table of Contents (conbtinued)

3-6	California Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study (1993-95) .....	37
3-7	Comparison of Various Incident Data Sources .....	38
4-1	Overall Incident Causes-Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	44
4-2A	Incident Rates by Year of Study-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	47
4-2B	Incident Rates by Year of Study-Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	48
4-3A	Incident Rates by Decade of Construction-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	50
4-3B	Incident Rates by Decade of Construction-Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	52
4-4A	Incident Rates by Normal Operating Temperature-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	54
4-4B	Incident Rates by Normal Operating Temperature-Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	56
4-5A	Incident Rates by Pipe Diameter-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	58
4-5B	Incident Rates by Pipe Diameter-Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	59
4-6A	Incident Rates by Leak Detection System-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	61
4-6B	Incident Rates by Leak Detection System-Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	62
4-7A	Cathodic Protection Systems-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	64
4-7B	Average Cathodic Protection Survey Intervals-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	65
4-7C	Cathodic Protection System-Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	67
4-7D	Incidents by Cathodic Protection System Inspections-Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	68
4-8A	Incidents by Pipe Specification-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	70
4-8B	Incident Rates by Pipe Specification-Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	72
4-9A	Incidents By Pipe Specification-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	74
4-9B	Incident Rates by Pipe Type-Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	76
4-10A	Incident Rates By Normal Operating Pressure-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	78
4-10B	Incident Rates by Normal Operating Pressure-Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	80
4-11A	Incident Rates by Coating Type-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	84
4-11B	Incident Rates by External Coating Type-Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	86
4-12A	Incidents By Internal Inspections-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	89
4-12B	Incident Rates by Internal Inspections-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	90
4-13A	Incident Rates by Month of Year-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	92
4-13B	Incident Rates by Month of Year-Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	93
4-14	Incidents by Item Which Leaked-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	95
4-15A	Average Hydrostatic Testing Interval During Study Period-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	99
4-15B	Time Since Last Hydrostatic Test At Time of Leak-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	100
4-15C	Average Pressure Testing Interval During Study Period-Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	102
4-16A	Spill Size Distribution-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	104
4-16B	Spill Size Distribution-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	105
4-16C	Spill Size Distribution-Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	108
4-17	Property Damage Distribution-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid Pipelines .....	110
4-18	Incident Rates by Above versus Below Grade Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	113

Table of Contents (continued)

4-19	Incident Rate by Above versus Below Grade Pipe.....	114
4-20	Recovery of Spilled Volumes - California Unregulated Pipelines .....	115
6-1A	Spill Size Distribution-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid vs Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	134
6-1B	Property Damage Distribution-CSFM Regulated Hazardous Liquid vs Crude Oil Pipelines Under Study .....	135